



the governance-access-learning network

Cases and Materials Relating to Corruption

INDEX to

Volume 2

Editor John Hatchard

A joint project of the Commonwealth Legal Education Association, The Commonwealth Magistrates' and Judges' Association, The Commonwealth Secretariat and TIRI

Funded by the BMZ Trust Fund for United Nations Development Programme for Accountability and Transparency in support of the Independent Corrupt Practices and Other Related Offences Commission of Nigeria

Editorial Contact: TIRI, 42 Castelnau, London SW13 9RU United Kingdom
Tel. +44 (0)77 98 915 659 Fax +44-(0)20 8748 7405 <http://www.tiri.org>

SUBJECT INDEX FOR VOLUME 2

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Application for judicial review -- Order 53 -- Powers of the High Court -- Admissibility of viva voce evidence -- Basic principles to be applied

Chiluba v Attorney General

Supreme Court of Zambia (2003)

Issue 4 p.43

Judicial review -- Application for orders of certiorari and mandamus -- Circumstances when such orders can be made

Chiluba v Attorney General

Supreme Court of Zambia (2003)

Issue 4 p.43

Rules of statutory construction -- Literal rule -- Circumstances when court may adopt a different construction

Poswa v Member of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Affairs Environment and Tourism

Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2001)

Issue 5 p.5

Statutory interpretation -- Public Service Act -- Prohibition on spouse of "public servant" being member of gaming board -- Meaning of "public servant" -- Whether ordinary meaning to be attached to "public servant"

Poswa v Member of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Affairs Environment and Tourism

Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2001)

Issue 5 p.5

Statutory interpretation -- Ambiguity in anti-corruption statute -- Whether court may look at the legislative history of a statute to aid interpretation

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4

Statutory interpretation -- Whether court should adopt a liberal construction of anti-corruption legislation

Special Investigating Unit v Nadasen

Supreme Court of South Africa (2001)

Issue 1 p.24

Statutory interpretation -- Ambiguity in anti-corruption statute -- Whether appropriate for court to consider title of statute to help resolve ambiguities

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4

Whistleblowing -- Application for a protection visa - review of decision of Refugee Review Tribunal -- Consideration of circumstances in which exposure of corruption or "whistleblowing" can give rise to a well founded fear of political persecution -- Whether the material and evidence before the Tribunal raised a case of political persecution

Zheng v Minister for Immigration & Multicultural Affairs

Federal Court of Australia (2000)

Issue 5 p.13

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

Constitutional Law -- "Overbreadth" of provision -- Meaning of concept

Poswa v Member of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Affairs Environment and Tourism
Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2001) **Issue 5 p.5**

Constitutionality of the appointment of a serving judge to head an anti-corruption commission

South African Association of Personal Injury Lawyers v Heath & Others
(Constitutional Court of South Africa, 2000) **Issue 1 p.7**

Freedom of expression -- Scope of the right -- Constitution of Grenada, section 10 -- Criminal libel -- Criminal Code of Grenada, section 252(2) -- Whether crime of libel inconsistent with constitutional right to freedom of expression -- Principles of interpretation to be adopted

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police
Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004) **Issue 4 p.65**

Presumption of innocence -- Burden of proof -- Whether prosecution to prove publication of the defamatory matter made "unlawfully" -- Constitution of Grenada, section 8(2)

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police
Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004) **Issue 4 p.65**

Parliament -- Scope of power to lift immunity from prosecution on former president for alleged corruption -- Constitution of Zambia, article 43(3)

Chiluba v Attorney General
Supreme Court of Zambia (2003) **Issue 4 p.43**

Parliament -- Whether court may review decision of the National Assembly to remove the immunity from prosecution of a former president -- Section 34 National Assembly (Powers and Privileges) Act

Chiluba v Attorney General
Supreme Court of Zambia (2003) **Issue 4 p.43**

Right to be heard -- Whether article provides right for former president to be heard by the National Assembly -- Constitution of Zambia, article 43(3)

Chiluba v Attorney General
Supreme Court of Zambia (2003) **Issue 4 p.43**

Search and seizure -- Power to authorise search and seizure warrants for purposes of a "preparatory investigation" -- Whether power contravened constitutional right to privacy - Principles of constitutional interpretation to be applied

Investigating Directorate: Serious Economic Offices v Hyundai and Another
Constitutional Court of South Africa (2000) **Issue 2 p.48**

Whether court may review the decision of the National Assembly to remove the immunity from prosecution of a former president -- Section 34 National Assembly (Powers and Privileges) Act

Chiluba v Attorney General
Supreme Court of Zambia (2003) **Issue 4 p.43**

Whether provision reasonable and justifiable in an open and democratic society -- Constitution of South Africa, section 36(1)

Poswa v Member of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Affairs Environment and Tourism
Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2001) **Issue 5 p.5**

CRIMINAL LAW

Bribery -- Representation agreement -- Factors to be considered when determining genuineness of agreement

Acres International v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003) **Issue 3 p.44**

Bribery -- Representation agreement -- Factors to be considered when determining genuineness of agreement

Lahmeyer International GmbH v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003) **Issue 3 p.70**

Corruption -- "Any agent who accepts any advantage on account of his showing or having shown favour or disfavour to any person in relation to his principal's affairs or business" -- Whether phrase covers acceptance of past favours -- Prevention of Corruption Ordinance section 9(1)(b)

Launder v HKSAR
Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal (2001) **Issue 5 p.27**

Corruption -- Whether offence involves element of dishonesty

The Queen v Leolahi
(Court of Appeal of New Zealand, 2000) **Issue 1 p.63**

Criminal libel -- Constitutionality of offence

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police
Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004) **Issue 4 p.65**

Evidence -- Admissibility -- Evidence of payments by other contractors to intermediary -- Whether evidence against the appellant

Lahmeyer International GmbH v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003) **Issue 3 p.70**

Jurisdiction of court to entertain the appeal -- Constitution of Niue, article 55A(2)(d)

Lakatini v The Police
Court of Appeal of Niue (1995) **Issue 5 p.41**

Mens rea -- Offence of "corrupt use of official information" -- Whether accused must know the information obtained "in a criminal manner"

The Queen v Leolahi
Court of Appeal of New Zealand, 2000 **Issue 1 p.63**

Misdirection by trial judge -- Failure of defence to object to directions at the trial -- Whether a bar to an appeal

Launder v HKSAR
Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal (2001) **Issue 5 p.27**

Offence of official corruption -- Scope of phrase "holder of any office ... in the service of Her Majesty"-- Whether an Assemblyman or a Minister is "in the service of Her Majesty" -- section 180 Niue Act 1966

Lakatini v The Police

Court of Appeal of Niue (1995)

Issue 5 p.41

Presumption of innocence -- Burden of proof -- Whether prosecution to prove publication of the defamatory matter made "unlawfully" -- Constitution of Grenada, section 8(2)

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police

Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004)

Issue 4 p.65

Right to freedom of expression -- Scope of the right -- Whether crime of libel inconsistent with constitutional right to freedom of expression -- Principles of interpretation to be adopted -- Constitution of Grenada, section 10 -- Criminal Code of Grenada, section 252(2)

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police

Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004)

Issue 4 p.65

Scope of the offence bribery of foreign public officials -- Meaning of the phrase "in order to assist in obtaining or retaining business" -- Whether offence extended to bribing customs officials for purposes of reducing customs duties and sales taxes -- Foreign Corrupt Practices Act

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4

Sentence -- Appropriate procedure for determining sentence for corporation

Lahmeyer International GmbH v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.70

"State official" -- Meaning of -- Whether includes public officer seconded to a statutory body

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Voters -- Acceptance of bribe from parliamentary candidate -- When act constitutes criminal liability

Ah Him v Amosa

Supreme Court of Samoa (2001)

Issue 1 p.46

ELECTORAL MALPRACTICE

Electors -- Acceptance of bribe from parliamentary candidate -- When criminal liability established

Ah Him v Amosa

Supreme Court of Samoa (2001)

Issue 1 p.46

Gifts -- Presenting gifts to supporters by parliamentary candidate -- When a corrupt practice

Ah Him v Amosa

Supreme Court of Samoa (2001)

Issue 1 p.46

EVIDENCE AND PROCEDURE

Admissibility -- Evidence of payments by other contractors to intermediary -- Whether evidence against the appellant

Acres International v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.44

Application to re-open defence case -- Applicable principles

Sole v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Burden of proof -- Criminal libel -- Presumption of innocence -- Whether prosecution to prove publication of the defamatory matter made "unlawfully"

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police
Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004)

Issue 4 p.65

Circumstantial evidence -- Rule in *R v Blom* -- Principles of inferential reasoning -- When to be applied

Sole v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Corroboration -- Whether recipient of bribe can corroborate the evidence of another bribee

Ah Him v Amosa
Supreme Court of Samoa (2001)

Issue 1 p.46

Disclosure of evidence to defence -- Application by defence for disclosure of documents -- Alleged failure to receive all relevant documents -- Whether a miscarriage of justice -- Principles to be applied

The Queen v Dawson
Court of Appeal of New Zealand (2004)

Issue 4 p.33

Expert witness -- Refusal of the trial judge to permit accused to call expert witness -- Whether constituting a misdirection

Sole v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Indictment -- Retrospective operation and constitutionality -- Criminal Procedure and Evidence (Amendment) Act 2001

Sole v The Crown
Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Investigation undertaken by private individual -- Whether police under an obligation to ensure impartial and objective assessment of the evidence before commencement of criminal proceedings

The Queen v Dawson
Court of Appeal of New Zealand (2004)

Issue 4 p.33

Jurisdiction -- No evidence that corrupt agreement made in Lesotho -- Whether jurisdiction established where the harmful effect occurred within Lesotho -- Evidence required to prove harmful effect

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Loss of evidence by prosecution -- Approach to be taken by the court -- Duty placed on prosecution to provide explanation

The Queen v Dawson

Court of Appeal of New Zealand (2004)

Issue 4 p.33

Right to silence -- Evidential value -- Whether drawing of an adverse inference from silence of accused unconstitutional

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Right to remain silent -- Applicant summoned for questioning by National Prosecuting Authority into allegations of corruption -- Constitutionality of power to question any person believed able to furnish any information -- National Prosecuting Authority Act 32 of 1998

Shaik v Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development and Others

Constitutional Court of South Africa (2003)

Issue 5 p.48

Search warrant -- Scope of statutory powers of Independent Commission Against Corruption to issue a search warrant

Commissioner of the Independent Commission Against Corruption v Ch'ng Poh

Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (1997)

Issue 1 p.41

Search and seizure powers – Power to authorise search and seizure warrants for purposes of a “preparatory investigation” – Whether power contravened constitutional right to privacy - Principles of constitutional interpretation

Investigating Directorate: Serious Economic Offices v Hyundai and Others

Constitutional Court of South Africa (2000)

Issue 2 p.48

INDICTMENT

Sufficiency of indictment -- Crown unable to supply detailed information about time and place of corrupt bargain

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Sufficiency of indictment -- Whether indictment needs to go further than "tracking" the language of the statute -- Foreign Corrupt Practices Act

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4

INSOLVENCY

Authority to institute proceedings -- Striking out of new matter in replying affidavit deemed to have been received for employer

Ganes & Ganes v Telecom Namibia Limited

Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2003)

Issue 5 p.63

Bribes or secret commissions received by employee in course of employment -- Whether deemed to have been received for employer

Ganes & Ganes v Telecom Namibia Limited

Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2003)

I Issue 5 p.63

JURISDICTION

Jurisdiction -- No evidence that corrupt agreement made in Lesotho -- Whether jurisdiction established where the harmful effect occurred within Lesotho -- Evidence required to prove harmful effect

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

MUTUAL ASSISTANCE

Mutual assistance request to Canada from Russia to obtain documents in pursuance of a corruption investigation -- Whether documents could be sent in the following circumstances: (a) where they were not specifically referred to in the request; (b) where the documents might relate to offences that were the subject of an amnesty order in the requesting state; (c) where some documents were or may not be not relevant to the investigation

In re Pokidyshev and Rodionov

Court of Appeal for Ontario (1999)

Issue 2 p.34

Effect of failure by requesting country to specify type of legal assistance required

In re Pokidyshev and Rodionov

Court of Appeal for Ontario (1999)

Issue 2 p.34

ORGANISATION AND POWERS OF ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSIONS

Appointment of a serving judge to head an anti-corruption commission -- Whether constitutional

South African Association of Personal Injury Lawyers v Heath & Others

Constitutional Court of South Africa (2000)

Issue 1 p.7

Statutory interpretation of anti-corruption legislation -- Whether court should adopt a liberal construction

Special Investigating Unit v Nadasen

Supreme Court of South Africa (2001)

Issue 1 p.24

Search warrant -- Scope of statutory powers of Independent Commission Against Corruption to issue a search warrant

Commissioner of the Independent Commission Against Corruption v Ch'ng Poh

Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (1997)

Issue 1 p.41

PROCEEDS OF CRIME

Proceeds of crime -- Respondent applying fugitive disentitlement doctrine and seeking to register foreign restraint order in England -- Whether contrary to the interests of justice to do so -- Whether contrary to the right to a fair trial to do so -- Test to be applied

Government of the United States of America v Barnette and Another

House of Lords (2004)

Issue 5 p.72

Right to a fair trial -- European Convention on Human Rights, article 6 -- Whether article 6 protection applicable to enforcement of foreign judgment made in non-convention State

Government of the United States of America v Barnette and Another

House of Lords (2004)

Issue 5 p.72

SENTENCING

Co-accused -- Non-custodial sentence imposed -- Whether court should take this into account when considering length of sentence

R v Bush

Court of Appeal (Criminal Division)(2003)

Issue 5 p.85

Corporation -- Appropriate procedure for determining sentence

Acres International v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.44

Corruption -- Payment of £700,000 to products manager of an international company in return for contracts -- length of sentence

R v Myatt and Winkles

Court of Appeal (Criminal Division)(2004)

Issue 5 p.89

Deterrent sentence -- Need to take into account both aggravating and mitigating features

Acres International v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.44

Deterrent sentence -- Senior customs official pleading guilty to corruption -- Need for deterrent sentence -- Whether custodial sentence appropriate -- High level of trust and systematic course of corruption as aggravating factors -- Effect of failure of trial judge to address expressly the mitigating factors

The Queen v Nua

Court of Appeal of New Zealand (2001)

Issue 2 p.68

Mitigating factors -- plea of guilty and accused of previous exemplary character -- effect on length of sentence

R v Myatt and Winkles

Court of Appeal (Criminal Division)(2004)

Issue 5 p.89

Sentence -- Aggravating features -- Gross abuse of trust over a period of six years -- Effect on length of sentence

R v Bush

Court of Appeal (Criminal Division)(2003)

Issue 5 p.85

Sentence -- Council officer soliciting payments in return for placing company on list of approved contractors -- £40,000 received over six year period -- Length of sentence

R v Bush

Court of Appeal (Criminal Division)(2003)

Issue 5 p.85

Use of concurrent and consecutive sentences on different counts -- When appropriate

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

STATUTORY CONSTRUCTION

Ambiguity in anti-corruption statute -- Whether court may look at the legislative history of a statute to aid interpretation

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4

Ambiguity in anti-corruption statute -- Whether appropriate for court to consider title of statute to help resolve ambiguities

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4

Literal rule -- Circumstances when court may adopt a different construction

Poswa v Member of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Affairs Environment and Tourism

Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2001)

Issue 5 p.5

Principles of constitution interpretation -- Right to freedom of expression -- Scope of the right -- Whether crime of libel inconsistent with constitutional right to freedom of expression -- Constitution of Grenada, section 10 -- Criminal Code of Grenada, section 252(2)

Worme and Grenada Today Limited v Commissioner of Police

Judicial Committee of the Privy Council (2004)

Issue 4 p.65

Whether court should adopt a liberal construction of anti-corruption legislation

Special Investigating Unit v Nadasen

Supreme Court of South Africa (2001)

Issue 1 p.24

WORDS AND PHRASES

Scope of phrase "holder of any office ... in the service of Her Majesty"-- Whether an Assemblyman or a Minister is "in the service of Her Majesty"

Lakatini v The Police

Court of Appeal of Niue (1995)

Issue 5 p.41

"Public servant" -- Public Service Act -- Prohibition on spouse of "public servant" being member of gaming board -- Meaning of "public servant" -- Whether ordinary meaning in the Public Service Act to be attached to "public servant"

Poswa v Member of the Executive Council responsible for Economic Affairs Environment and Tourism

Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa (2001)

Issue 5 p.5

"State official" -- Meaning of -- Whether includes public officer seconded to a statutory body

Sole v The Crown

Court of Appeal of Lesotho (2003)

Issue 3 p.11

Meaning of the phrase "in order to assist in obtaining or retaining business"

United States of America v Kay and Murphy

United States Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit (2004)

Issue 4 p.4